



**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

SUMMARIZED MINUTES

Monday, August 10, 2020

Meeting Held Electronically

PRESENT: Janice Shimokubo, Chair
Emily Hinchman, Vice Chair
James Eaneman
Marty Day
Hannellie Mendoza
Stuart Rhoden

ABSENT: Conay Huizar

STAFF: Sharon Cini
Kelly Corsette
Stephanie Hirata
Bill Hylan
Brent Stockwell
Stanna Slater

Call to Order/Roll Call

Chair Shimokubo called the meeting to order at 5:00 p.m.

Public Comment

Chair Shimokubo requested that Ms. Cini follow up with the individual who submitted a question during the July 13, 2020 meeting.

No members of the public submitted comments during this meeting.

1. Approval of minutes from the July 13, 2020 meeting

COMMISSIONER EANEMAN MOVED TO APPROVE THE JULY 13, 2020 HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES. COMMISSIONER RHODEN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SIX (6) TO ZERO (0) BY ROLL CALL VOTE. CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, DAY, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

2. Presentation, discussion and recommendations regarding a non-discrimination ordinance, including adding an anti-harassment, non-discrimination and non-retaliation policy applicable to elected and appointed officials

- Discussion document regarding adopting a non-discrimination ordinance and anti-harassment policy
- Comparison with other Arizona cities' non-discrimination ordinances

Chair Shimokubo recalled elements of the prior discussion about a non-discrimination ordinance and the possibility of a censure policy. Vice-Chair Hinchman stressed the importance of expeditiously approving both recommendations and moving them forward.

Discussion ensued regarding the proposed non-discrimination ordinance. Commissioners expressed an interest in revising the section on public accommodation to include facilities and access and demand and fixed-rate services. Mr. Stockwell explained that "public accommodations" is defined under state and federal civil rights laws. Concerns were expressed about the exemption given to tax-exempt organizations and political parties and the ramifications that could be experienced with regard to responding to negative activities of certain religious organizations. Under the heading of enforcement, the topic of who would hold the responsibility of appointing a mediator and the possibility of including enforcement against displaying derogatory symbols in a public place or on private property. Mr. Hylan said that inclusion of a statement regarding derogatory symbols is outside of the scope of the non-discrimination ordinance.

COMMISSIONER EANEMAN MOVED TO ACCEPT THE DRAFT NON-DISCRIMINATION ORDINANCE AS AMENDED DURING THE MEETING. VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SIX (6) TO ZERO (0) BY ROLL CALL VOTE. CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, DAY, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

Discussion ensued regarding the proposed anti-harassment, non-discrimination, non-retaliation policy. Vice-Chair Hinchman reminded everyone that the policy is specific to elected and appointed officials. Commissioners talked about the scope of the policy, noting that the restrictions would only be applicable when the official was acting in the course and scope of their duties and would not carry over to their activities in private life. Stanna Slater expressed concern about the possibility that officials who speak out in response to negative activities of certain organizations could suffer ramifications under the policy. Mr. Stockwell suggested adding a statement indicating that the policy should not be interpreted to disallow any comments calling out hate speech.

COMMISSIONER EANEMAN MOVED TO APPROVE THE DRAFT ANTI-HARASSMENT POLICY AS AMENDED DURING THE MEETING. COMMISSIONER RHODEN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SIX (6) TO ZERO (0) BY ROLL CALL VOTE. CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, DAY, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

Commissioners made recommendations for the content of the letter to be written by the Chair and Vice-Chair to City Council asking that they consider both ordinances and offer a response in a timely manner.

COMMISSIONER EANEMAN MOVED THAT THE HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR PREPARE A LETTER TO CITY COUNCIL REQUESTING THEY CONSIDER ORDINANCES PER PROPOSALS ONE AND TWO AS APPROVED DURING THIS MEETING AND REQUEST A DISCUSSION OF CITY COUNCIL'S INTENDED NEXT STEPS BE PLACED ON A CITY COUNCIL AGENDA NO LATER THAN 60 DAYS FROM THE DATE OF THE LETTER. VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SIX (6) TO ZERO (0) BY ROLL CALL VOTE. CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, DAY, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

3. Presentation, discussion and recommendations regarding plans to host a series of Town Halls regarding the national discourse on race

- Review proposed plan of action – “Pilot” Town Hall Concept

Stephanie Hirata gave an overview of various types of virtual town hall meetings, best practices, examples of how meetings are run in the COVID environment and promotional opportunities.

Discussion ensued regarding who will moderate the discussions and who will comprise the panel. Mr. Corsette suggested that four panel members and a moderator has been shown to be the most successful model. Commissioners were in consensus to direct staff to move forward with scheduling a town hall as soon as possible.

- Staff report on best practices and suggestions for pre/post questionnaire

Commissioner Rhoden noted that the group is working on developing surveys for participants and panelists.

4. Discussion, updates and recommendations regarding recent diversity and inclusion related activities and incidents impacting the city of Scottsdale

- Human Rights Campaign - Review the 2019 Scottsdale Municipality Equality Index score card and review 2020 request for points

Ms. Cini said that the City of Scottsdale is reviewed each year by the Human Rights Campaign. Scottsdale's 2019 Municipality Equality Index score is 64 out of 100. She anticipates the 2020 score to be about 76 out of 100. She noted that if a non-discrimination ordinance, including sexual orientation, gender identity, public housing, and public accommodations is passed, the city would earn an additional 30 points.

- Employee Stories – “Sharing our Diversity” TEAMS Live dialogues

Ms. Cini said that the City’s Diversity Advisory Committee recently started a pilot program focusing on employee stories. Two employees recorded stories through Microsoft Teams Live and Scottsdale video network. She will forward the YouTube link to Commissioners.

5. Identification of Future Agenda Items

Future agenda items will include a discussion about hate crimes.

Next meeting is scheduled for September 14, 2020 at 5:00 p.m.

Adjournment

COMMISSIONER HINCHMAN MOVED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING. COMMISSIONER DAY SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SIX (6) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, DAY, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 7:22 p.m.

Recorded and Transcribed by eScribers, LLC.